



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

## Day 1: Introduction + Cash in the Long Term: Exploring Graduation + the Political Economy of Social Protection

| Timing        | Session Outline   | Presentations / Participants  |
|---------------|---|---|
| 08:30 – 09:00 | <b>Registration</b>   |   |
| 09:00 – 09:35 | <b>Session 1: Introductory remarks &amp; security briefing</b><br><i>Chair: Sarah Nehrling</i>  | Welcome statements: <b>Honorable George Mkuchika, Government of Tanzania / Paul Quarles van Ufford, UNICEF Tanzania / Benjamin Davis, FAO</b> [20 min]<br><br>Security briefing: <b>UNICEF Tanzania</b> [5 min]<br><br>Setting group norms & Slido Introduction. <b>Sarah Nehrling</b> [10 min] |
| 09:35 – 10:00 | <b>Session 2: Setting the scene</b><br><i>Reflections on building the Transfer Project “Evidence to Action” collaboration.</i>  | 10 years of the Transfer Project: Successes, challenges, lessons, & what’s next. <b>Benjamin Davis, FAO &amp; Ashu Handa, UNC</b> [25 min]<br><br>Plus: Group selfie & overview of the agenda   |
| 10:00 – 10:30 | <b>Session 3: Graduation from what &amp; for whom?</b><br><i>What do we mean by graduation? What is the difference between cash transfers &amp; graduation programmes? What can we expect from them? Can they co-exist?</i><br><br><i>Chair: Sarah Nehrling</i> | Conceptual framework & overview of the evidence: Graduation programmes in Africa & beyond. <b>Fabio Veras, IPC-IG</b> [20 min]<br><br>Discussion [10 min]   |
| 10:30 – 11:00 | <b>Tea Break</b>  |   |
| 11:00 – 12:00 | <b>Session 4: Cash transfers &amp; long-run human development: Emerging evidence from Latin America</b>   | Do conditional cash transfers improve outcomes in the next generation: Evidence from Mexico. <b>Susan Parker, University of Maryland</b> [15 min]   |



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

*The 'Cash Transfer revolution' started in Mexico (Progresa) & Brazil (Bolsa Familia) in the mid-1990s. Research was extremely influential in raising the "evidence bar" for social programmes. Results on the long-term effects of these early programmes are now trickling in—what do they say & what lessons do they hold for Africa? This panel examines the inter-generational effects of large-scale government cash transfer programmes & implications for Africa.*

*Chair: Gustavo Angeles, UNC*

Long-term impacts of conditional cash transfers: Review of the evidence.

**John Maluccio, Middlebury College** [15 min]

Discussant Remarks & Discussion [30 minutes]

12:00 – 12:45

## Session 5a: Cash transfers, graduation programmes & livelihood enhancements in sub-Saharan Africa

*What does a typical graduation programme look like? Does it achieve effects that are different from unconditional cash transfer programmes with a livelihood component?*

*Chair: Frank Otchere, UNICEF Innocenti*

The Concern World Wide's Graduation Model. **Rachel Sabates-Wheeler, Institute of Development Studies** [15 min]

Which beneficiaries have the most "graduation" potential? Evidence from Zambia's Unconditional Cash Transfer. **Gelson Tembo, University of Zambia** [15 min]

Discussion [15 min]

12:45 – 14:00

Lunch

14:00 – 15:15

## Session 5b: Cash transfers, productive inclusion & livelihood enhancements in sub-Saharan Africa (ctd.)

*Cash transfers have not only protective impacts, but also promotive & productive impacts. Households use the cash to meet, not only their most pressing needs, but invest it in ways that improve their well-being & productive capacity. How can this potential be leveraged further?*

*Chair: Papa Malick Gningue, Government of Senegal*

Scene setting: Reflections on productive impacts of cash transfers & implications for rural development. **Natalia Winder Rossi, FAO** [10 min]

Direct & indirect impacts of an unconditional cash transfer: Zimbabwe's Harmonized Social Cash Transfer. **Noemi Pace, FAO** [15 min]

Broad-based impacts of a UCT plus livelihood cash plus programme: Lesotho's CGP plus SPRINGS. **Silvio Daidone, FAO** [15 min]

Discussion [35 min]



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

15:15 – 15:45

**Session 6: The political economy of social protection in sub-Saharan Africa**

The politics of social protection in sub-Saharan Africa. **Sam Hickey, University of Manchester** [20 min]. Followed by Q&A [10 min]

17:30 – 18:15

**Session 7: Poster Session**

Mingle, discuss, & enjoy the latest from colleagues on social protection & cash transfer programming & evidence!

18:15 – 19:30

**Welcome Reception**



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

## Day 2: Latest Evidence from Tanzania & Across the Region

| Timing        | Session Outline   | Presentations / Participants   |
|---------------|---|--|
| 08:30 – 09:00 | <b>Who Wants to be a Millionaire?</b>   | <b>Tia Palermo, UNICEF Innocenti</b>   |
| 09:00 – 10:15 | <b>Session 8: Tanzania Social Action Fund (TASAF)</b><br><i>Focus on the in-depth experience of our hosts, including impacts of the most recent Productive Social Safety Net (PSSN) programmes.</i><br><br><i>Chair: Paul Quarles van Ufford, UNICEF Tanzania</i>   | PSSN intervention, graduation logic & impact on households, adolescents & women. <b>Selemani Masala, TASAF CCT Manager</b> [15 min]. Discussion [10 min]<br><br>PSSN Livelihoods Enhancement component & the Adolescent Cash Plus model overview & initial pilot findings. <b>Tatu Mwaruka, Livelihood Enhancement Manager</b> [15 min]. Discussion [20 min]   |
| 10:15 – 10:45 | <b>Tea Break</b>  |  |
| 10:45 – 11:45 | <b>Session 9: Cash transfers &amp; gender: What we know, what we don't know &amp; does it matter?</b><br><br><i>On the heels of the 63rd Commission on the Status of Women with the priority theme of social protection systems, how can cash transfers contribute to gender equality? This session explores intended &amp; unintended effects of cash transfers on gender equality &amp; implications for design of programmes.</i><br><br><i>Chair: Lusajo Kajula, UNICEF Innocenti</i> | Impacts of cash transfers on women's well-being in Africa: Are we moving the bar? <b>Amber Peterman, UNICEF Innocenti &amp; UNC</b> [12 min]<br><br>Impacts of Ghana LEAP 1000 through a gendered lens. <b>Tia Palermo, UNICEF Innocenti</b> [12 min]<br><br>Cash transfers, polygamy & intimate partner violence: Experimental evidence from Mali. <b>Melissa Hidrobo, IFPRI</b> [12 min]<br><br>Speed pitch: FAO Toolkit on gender-sensitive social protection to combat rural poverty & hunger. <b>Sara Abdoulayi, FAO RAF</b> [4 min]<br><br>Discussion [35 min] |
| 11:45 – 13:00 | <b>Session 10: The political economy of social protection</b>   | Small group discussions [40 minutes]   |



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

*How do political economy considerations influence social protection policy & programming?*

*Chair: Jennifer Yablonski, UNICEF Ghana*

1. Political economy of programme design (targeting, conditions, graduation objectives & beyond)
2. Political economy of elections & national politics
3. Politics of financing (national & international)
4. Political economy of evidence (use & generation)

**Small group chairs:** *Sidy Niang, FAO Ethiopia; Christine Mtonga, FAO Zambia; Yahaya Daouda, FAO Mali; Christine Follana, FAO Kenya; Daniel Kumitz, UNICEF Zambia; Jennifer Matafu, UNICEF Tanzania; Lisa-Marie Ouedraogo, UNICEF Ethiopia; Benjamin Sivasima, UNICEF WCARO*

Groups report to plenary & discussion [35 min]

13:00 – 14:00

Lunch

14:00 – 15:00

**Session 11: The political economy of social protection scale-up**

*Building on discussions from Day 1, national Governments participate in a 'Talk Show' on the political economy of social protection scale-up.*

*Host: Natalia Winder Rossi, FAO*

**Teferi Behailu, Government of Ethiopia**

**John Gachigi, Government of Kenya**

**Steve Chiwele, Government of Zambia**

Talk show [45 min], Discussion [30 min]

15:00 – 15:30

Tea Break

15:30 – 16:30

**Session 12: Cash transfers & children's productive activity**

Children's work & well-being: Mixed methods evidence from Malawi, Tanzania & Zambia. **Jacob de Hoop, UNICEF Innocenti** [10 min]



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

*Household & adult productive effects of cash transfers are often studied, however less is understood about how productive effects of unconditional cash affect children. Are household productive effects bad for children? How can we mitigate their potential negative effects?*

*Chair & Discussant: Kevin Hong, U.S. Department of Labour*

Child work in the Karamoja Early Childhood Development cash transfer programme. **Luisa Natali, UNICEF Innocenti** [10 min]

The impacts of Ethiopia's Social Cash Transfer on child work. **Ervin Prifti, FAO** [10 min]

Discussant Remarks [10 min] & Discussion [20 min]

16:30 – 17:30

## Session 13: Cash + health & nutrition services

*Cash transfers have positive impacts on several pathways, from food security to improved health. However, evidence on improvements in actual health outcomes has been limited. In light of this, several integrated or “cash plus” initiatives have been implemented to leverage cash for improved health outcomes. How do integrated approaches improve access to health services & health behaviours? Do they improve health outcomes?*

*Chair: Binta Isah Ismail, Government of Nigeria*

Nutrition Improvements through Cash & Health Education (NICHE) Program & the first 1000 days in Kenya. **John Gachigi, Government of Kenya** [10 min]

Impacts of the Improved Nutrition through Integrated Basic Social Services & Social Cash Transfer (IN SCT) in Ethiopia. **Surafel Mekonnen, Government of Ethiopia** [10 min]

Ghana LEAP 1000: Impacts on health insurance enrolment & health seeking. **Clement Adamba, University of Ghana** [10 min]

Discussion [30 min]

19:00 – 21:00

Special extra-curricular session



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

## Day 3: Evaluation Methodologies + Innovative Programmes on the Horizon + Putting Evidence to Action

| Timing        | Session Outline   | Presentations/ Participants   |
|---------------|---|---|
| 09:00 – 10:00 | <p><b>Session 15: Methodological Corner</b></p> <p><i>More countries are relying on mixed-methods (Q<sup>2</sup>) approaches to impact evaluation. What are the different ways to mix qualitative &amp; quantitative methods to maximize synergies? How does the research question affect the appropriate approach?</i></p> <p><i>Chair: Sarah Nehrling</i></p> | <p>How to get the most out of a Q<sup>2</sup> design. <b>Clare Barrington, UNC</b> [15 min]</p> <p>Evaluating a poverty reduction &amp; climate change adaptation programme. <b>Silvio Daidone, FAO</b> [15 min]</p> <p>Discussion, Q&amp;A [30 min]</p>  |
| 10:00 – 11:00 | <p><b>Session 16: What is cooking?</b></p> <p><i>Presenters share a quick look at some interesting &amp; innovative new programmes in the pipeline [5 min each]</i></p> <p><i>Chair: Pamela Pozarny, FAO RAF</i></p>  | <p>Providing off-grid energy solutions to the most vulnerable through cash support. <b>Yves Dublin, UNICEF Kenya</b></p> <p>Ethiopia's pilot 'cash plus' health insurance system linkages. <b>Debebe Barud Dera, Government of Ethiopia</b></p> <p>Mali Cash+ <b>Daouda Yahaya, FAO Mali</b></p> <p>Burkina Faso: A Cash Plus Programme. <b>Moussa Sankara, UNICEF Burkina Faso</b></p> <p>Mozambique's 'Cash &amp; Care' Child Grant: An integrated social protection programme. <b>Felix Matusse, Government of Mozambique</b></p> <p>Malawi - Cash top-up, coupled with the food support &amp; Severe Acute Malnutrition (SAM) treatment. <b>Brian Kiswii, UNICEF Malawi</b></p> <p>Q&amp;A [30 min]</p> |



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

|               |   |  |
|---------------|---|--|
| 11:00 – 11:30 | Tea Break   |  |
| 11:30 – 12:45 | <p><b>Session 17: Evidence to action</b></p> <p><i>Impact evaluations &amp; related studies are ultimately done to influence decision-making. But 'evidence-uptake' is difficult &amp; requires other conditions as well. What is the experience (negative &amp; positive) in using evidence to influence decisions? What are the barriers? What lessons can we uncover for the group?</i></p> <p><i>Chair: Ashu Handa, UNC</i></p> | <p>National researcher perspective. <b>Jennifer Nyakinya, Network of Impact Evaluation Researchers in Africa (NIERA)</b></p> <p>Civil society perspective. <b>Susan Mlewa, Southern African Social Protection Experts Network (SASPEN)</b></p> <p>Donor perspective. <b>Josephine Mwangi, Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida) Kenya</b></p> <p>Multilateral perspective. <b>Paul Quarles van Ufford, UNICEF Tanzania &amp; Benjamin Davis, FAO</b></p> <p>Government perspective. <b>Innocent Phiri, Government of Malawi</b></p> <p>Discussion [10 min]</p> |
| 12:45 – 13:30 | <p><b>Session 18: Closing, next steps &amp; awards ceremony</b></p> <p><i>The final session will encourage a reflection on what has been accomplished so far within the Transfer Project, a summary of the workshop, &amp; what is the next frontier of research. Audience members will be encouraged to share concluding thoughts &amp; ways forward for social protection on the continent.</i></p>                               | <p>Final reflections &amp; awards ceremony</p>   |
| 13:30 – 14:00 | Lunch & Depart  |  |





# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

## Poster Session, Tuesday 2<sup>nd</sup> April

| Poster Title/ Topic  | Presenters   | Session     |
|--|--|-------------|
| <b>ESRF: Baseline study in Local Government Authorities supported by Tanzania Third Poverty Reduction Project</b>  | Vivian Kazi, Economic and Social Research Foundation                                       |             |
| <b>From Livelihood trajectories to graduation from the PSNP: Information sharing &amp; learning from Ethiopia</b>  | Sidy Gueye Niang, FAO<br>Behailu Teferi, Government of Ethiopia                            |             |
| <b>Improved Nutrition through Integrated Basic Social Services &amp; Social Cash Transfer (IN SCT) – Qualitative Impact Evaluation</b>   | Lisa-Marie Ouedraogo-Wasi, UNICEF Ethiopia<br>Ato Surafel Mekonnen, Government of Ethiopia | 14          |
| <b>Situation &amp; access to services of people with disabilities &amp; homeless people in two sub-cities of Addis Ababa to inform the Urban Productive Safety Net Project (UPSNP) in Ethiopia</b> | Lisa-Marie Ouedraogo-Wasi, UNICEF Ethiopia<br>Ato Debebe Barud, Government of Ethiopia     | 16          |
| <b>Kenya: Social Protection Integrated Approach in Rural Areas: Rural Youth Migration, Social Protection &amp; Sustainable Value Chains</b>  | Christine Follana, FAO Kenya   |             |
| <b>Complementary Activities Towards Harmonization &amp; Consolidation Strategy for the National Safety Net Programme, Kenya</b>  | UNICEF Kenya + WFP Kenya   |             |
| <b>Improving cost-effectiveness of social protection programmes through better coordination and implementation</b>   | Frank van Kesteren, INCLUDE Platform   | 6, 7, 9, 10 |
| <b>Lesotho: National Information system for Social Assistance</b>  | UNICEF Lesotho + Government  |             |



# Transfer Project Workshop

Social Protection, Cash Transfers & Long-Term Poverty Reduction

2-4 April 2019, Mount Meru Hotel, Arusha, Tanzania

## Madagascar: Results of the FIAVOTA IE

UNICEF Madagascar + Government

## Social cash transfers, transitions to adulthood among Youth: Evidence from end-line evaluations of national programs in Malawi

Innocent Phiri & Massimo Chisinga, Government of Malawi

## NIERA: Information sharing

Jennifer Nyakinya, Network of Impact Evaluation Researchers in Africa

## SASPEN Showcase: Learn more about the network & how experts can join

Susan Mlewa, Southern African Social Protection Experts Network

## TASAF Productive Social Safety Net programme: findings from impact evaluations

Selemani Masala, TASAF

11

## Using Administrative Data to Inform Cash Transfer Programming

Christopher Chibwana, IDinsight

## Zambia: Scale up 2017 & the findings from the admin data analysis

UNICEF Zambia + Government

## Zimbabwe: HSCT impacts on violence against youth

Ashu Handa, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

12 & 14